# MUSIC IN POSTSOCIALISM: THREE DECADES IN RETROSPECT

Editors
Biljana Milanović, Melita Milin and Danka Lajić Mihajlović

#### МУЗИКА У ПОСТСОЦИЈАЛИЗМУ: ТРИ ДЕЦЕНИЈЕ КАСНИЈЕ

*Уреднице* Биљана Милановић, Мелита Милин и Данка Лајић Михајловић

#### MUSIC IN POSTSOCIALISM: THREE DECADES IN RETROSPECT

#### MUSIC IN POSTSOCIALISM: THREE DECADES IN RETROSPECT

**Editors** 

Biljana Milanović, Melita Milin and Danka Lajić Mihajlović

Publisher

Institute of Musicology of the Serbian Academy of Sciences and Arts

For the Publisher

Katarina Tomašević, Director

Peer-reviewers of the book Dejan Despić, Serbian Academy of Sciences and Arts Ranka Gašić, Institute of Contemporary History, Belgrade Jelena Jovanović, Institute of Musicology SASA

Translation from Serbian to English Zorica Simović

English-language editing
Dave Calcutt
Zorica Simović
Ivan Moody
Esther Helajzen

Cover design and prepress Aleksandra Kapor

Printed by GIR MS štampa, Mladenovac

Circulation 250

ISBN: 978-86-80639-60-4

© Institute of Musicology SASA, 2020 The Publication was financially supported by the Ministry of Education, Science and Technological Development of the Republic of Serbia.

### MUSIC IN POSTSOCIALISM: THREE DECADES IN RETROSPECT

**Editors** 

Biljana Milanović, Melita Milin and Danka Lajić Mihajlović

## МУЗИКА У ПОСТСОЦИЈАЛИЗМУ: ТРИ ДЕЦЕНИЈЕ КАСНИЈЕ

Уреднице Биљана Милановић, Мелита Милин и Данка Лајић Михајловић

Institute of Musicology of the Serbian Academy of Sciences and Arts Музиколошки институт Српске академије наука и уметности

Belgrade/Београд 2020

## Contents

	ote on Transliteration	
	nowledgements	
	of Figures and Tables's on Contributors	
11016.	on controllinos	., 171
Intro	oduction	1
1.	Music in Postsocialism – Looking Back at the First Three Decades	
	Melita Milin, Biljana Milanović, and Danka Lajić Mihajlović	1
Part	I: Rethinking the Past, Shaping the Present: Tradition, Memory	
	New Music	19
2.	Postsocialism and Other <i>-isms</i> in Slovene Music Since 1991: Post/Modernity, Post-Histori/ci/sm (Post-Classicism),	
	Post-Nationalism, and Glocalism Leon Stefanija	21
3.	Reflections on Lithuanian Postsocialist Music	41
	in the Framework of the Genotype Institution	
	Gražina Daunoravičienė	37
4.	Rethinking the Soviet-Era Georgian Music	
	Rusudan Tsurtsumia	67
5.	National and General Signs of the Ukrainian Church Music of the Present	
	Lyubov Kyyanovska	87
6.	Serbian Orthodox Choral Music: Its Revival	
	Over the Three Last Decades	
	Bogdan Đaković	109
7.	After the End of the World. On Music	
	in Hans Jürgen Syberberg's <i>Café Zilm</i>	121

	II: Festivals and Institutions: Strategies of Existence Survival	137
8.	On Missed Opportunities: The International Review of Composers in Belgrade and the "Postsocialist Condition" Jelena Janković-Beguš and Ivana Medić	139
9.	Festival/isation of Art Music – The Collapse or Recreation of Sarajevo Concert Life Fatima Hadžić	169
10.	Socialist and Postsocialist Histories Reflected in the Recent Past of the Bucharest Philharmonic Valentina Sandu-Dediu	185
11.	Critical Years: Debates in the Field of Hungarian Music (1988–1992)  Anna Dalos	209
12.	Music and Business in Postsocialist Russia Lidia Ader and Konstantin Belousov	221
	III: Changing Landscapes of Traditional and ılar Musics	243
13.	Folklore in the Communist Period and its Later Extensions: The Romanian Case Speranţa Rădulescu	245
14.	Postsocialism and the Culture of Kazakhstan: National Music in the Era of Global Changes Gulzada N. Omarova	273
15.	Euphoria and Creativity: Bulgarian Music in the Time of Transition  Claire Levy	295
16.	The Phenomenon of Slavic Metal. The Case of Poland Anna G. Piotrowska	
Index	ŗ	337

**CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION** 

#### Music in Postsocialism – Looking Back at the First Three Decades

Melita Milin, Biljana Milanović and Danka Lajić Mihajlović

In November of 2019, the world celebrated thirty years since the fall of the Berlin Wall, an event that marked the symbolic beginning of the fall of state socialism in the Soviet Union (USSR) and its European satellite states, as well as Yugoslavia. Maybe unexpectedly, that epochal event did not provoke major armed conflict, with the tragic exception of Yugoslavia, which had also been a special case throughout the socialist period, and to a lesser degree the regional wars and conflicts in USSR, the one in Chechnya having been the most deadly. A number of new countries emerged as a consequence of demands over sovereignty or independence within collapsing multinational socialist states. The processes from the first attempts to dismantle the state socialist regimes in the spring of 1989 to the final establishment of new democratic states had different dynamics but could be considered accomplished by the end of 1991. In that respect Yugoslavia was again an exception, as its process of dissolution lasted until 2006.

Observed in retrospect, 1989 did not come as a complete surprise, since, in the preceding decades, in all of the concerned countries, there had been many self-organised pro-democracy movements and activities of well-known dissidents, as well as popular unrest of different intensities. The thirtieth anniversary of the *annus mirabilis* is an occasion to revisit not only all those complex and shifting processes, but also those that have taken place since then, and to reconsider them through the lens of the present (Falk 2019: 1). So, as might have been foreseen, besides obvious economic and social successes, "there has been a populist backlash to the neoliberal reform programs of privatisation and marketisation that were accompanied with no small amount of corruption and enrichment on the part of the previous *nomenklatura* and the creation of a class of crass *nouveaux riches* – in societies attuned to both egalitarian val-

ues (four decades of communist ideology had *some* effect) and social apathy" (ibid.). Of course, the challenges posed by neoliberalism are not restricted to former socialist countries, as, since the 1970s, that ideology has been triumphantly marching across the world, being imposed by most developed Western countries whose artists and musicians had also to adjust to the assumption that their place in society is defined by their political and/or economic usefulness (León 2014: 133).

Since the terms "postsocialism" and "postcommunism" are often used interchangeably, it is necessary to note that it is widely accepted that the former term relates more to culture, subjectivities and everyday life, whereas the latter focuses mainly on political and economic processes of adaptation to new circumstances, as well as on formal changes in general (Müller 2019: 7). It is for that reason that we have decided to privilege the term "postsocialism" in this publication, though we have let our authors use the other term if they found it more suitable for a specific context. While having decided so, we are, however, aware of the plausibility of the arguments that postcommunism should be differentiated from postsocialism on the grounds that communism was based on the promise of a classless society that would be realised in an unspecified future, whereas socialism was a lived experience for many decades in a number of countries (Jelača and Lugarić 2018: 2). On the other hand, there are authors such as Maria Todorova and Zsuzsa Gille who have opted for the term "postcommunism" (Todorova and Gille 2010), so that the use of both terms seems rather unstable for now.

Although mainly referring to chronology, the term "[post]socialism" always connotes the dictatorial anti-democratic political system that collapsed as a failed alternative to capitalism. But the term postsocialism has been increasingly questioned from different and multidisciplinary angles. We could draw attention here to the critique of postsocialism as a concept, undertaken recently by Martin Müller, who sees it as referring to a "vanishing object; emphasising rupture over continuity; falling into a territorial trap; issuing from orientalising knowledge construction; and constraining political futures" (Müller 2019: 1). Together with some other authors (Humphrey 2001: 13; Boyer and Yurchak 2008: 9; Ost 2009; Platt 2009), Müller claims that the term postsocialism will soon prove to be unfit for investigating societies that are the heirs to those that existed under state socialism. One could, however, try to research comparatively certain segments of life before and after the collapse of socialism in those countries and this volume on music could, hopefully, contribute to some more systematic work in the future. Various factors will have to be included into such analyses, such as national cultural traditions before the socialists' coming to power, how they were transformed during state socialism (this was not the same everywhere) and the varied and specific differences in developments after the Wall. Undoubtedly, a reasonable decision will have to be made as to how long those countries will be designated as postsocialist. By comparison, the term "post-transition" has already been conceptualised in relation to "transition", as a period of social stabilisation in which there should not be divides between, for instance, Western and Eastern Europe, referring not only to politics and economy, but also to culture and arts (Šuvaković 2017).

Former socialist countries are most often analysed from the aspect of transition processes from socialism to capitalism, which can be rather abrupt, but are usually gradual and characterised by the creation of hybrid forms and a pronounced plurality of strategies and achievements. According to some authors, the transition period is officially over at present because the privatisation process and the legitimation of the new property class were already achieved by the end of the millennium (Todorova 2018: 642). On the other hand, there are also well-founded views that transition was finalised in practically all postsocialist countries somewhat later - in the course of the first two decades of the twenty-first century, with the exception of Serbia and some other countries of the former Yugoslavia, where, according to some authors, it is not yet finished (Jakopin 2018). In the case of Serbia, the main causes for such a situation include the disintegration of Yugoslavia, the wars of the 1990s, sanctions by the Western countries, the NATO bombing, hyperinflation and an almost continuous macro-economic instability, all of which hindered the process (Gligorić 2013: 9). It is also difficult to fix the date of the beginning of the transition in Serbia because it had already been anticipated at the end of the 1980s but then came the turbulent 1990s that followed the dramatic break-up of the country and the fall of socialism, so it is possible to view the deposition of Slobodan Milošević in 2000 as the end of a great disorder with combined postsocialism and wars, and, at the same time, the real beginning of the transition (Göler and Lehmeier 2012: 38). It should be added that the many varieties of transitional schemes could be observed not only in the spheres of politics and economics but also in those of culture and, more specifically, in the spheres of the arts and music. However, the latter areas seem to have received insufficient scholarly attention, probably because it required both a thorough knowledge of pre-Berlin-Wall developments and theoretical tools for analysing the later transitional period of dynamic changes. As co-editors of this volume, we expect that the field of transitional/postsocialist studies of music, with the results presented here, could enrich postsocialist studies in general.

The issue of the rupture between socialism and postsocialism, which is still open to debate, could get some new tones from the contributions to this volume. There seems to be no doubt about the revolutionary effects of the 1989–91 collapse of socialism, although most of the involved countries did not experience much violence. The lived experiences are, however, so varied that in some countries continuity with the past regimes in some spheres of life often stayed present to a greater or lesser degree, for more than just a few years. The chapters of this volume are also a demonstration of how difficult it is to apply generalised claims about developments in all postsocialist countries, and that countries of, for instance, the "Vyšegrad group" cannot represent all of them. Therefore, it is important to escape the territorial trap, by which is meant the application of the term postsocialism almost exclusively to countries of Central and Eastern Europe that are already in the European Union, thereby ex-

cluding the countries that existed within the Soviet Union (Pickles 2010: 131). In that way, only the former socialist countries geographically close to Western Europe and politically and economically integrated into the Western capitalist world are considered to be models of more or less successful paths towards modernity, whereas the others are often out of focus because of their harder struggle to move forward. That is one of the aspects that makes it difficult to speak about postsocialism as an umbrella term applied to all those countries. We are happy that for this volume we have managed to obtain several contributions from countries outside the European Union, providing, thus, a certain balance and a more complex demonstration of the area of research.

As in many other fields, a dominance over postsocialist studies is held by Western, mainly Anglophone, academia, resulting at times in problematic constructions. Müller is right to view such works as bringing an orientalising tendency mirroring the classic colonial attitude towards the non-West (Müller 2019: 1). Volumes like ours could contribute to gaining a larger picture of the period observed (with one exception) from an insider's position. More dialogues and debates between researchers holding multiple perspectives and methodologies would certainly be fruitful. Among the themes that could be debated are the capabilities of postsocialist societies to fight against the radical neoliberalism that is too often offered or imposed as a path without alternatives, and their attempts to reappropriate some of the ideas from the "real-socialist" times.

Connected to all the mentioned issues is that of the impact of radically changed political and social structural bases on national and other collective identifications in all the postsocialist countries. Again, it is impossible to find a common denominator of these processes. Numerous sociological researches have been conducted that have analysed the ways in which the populations reacted and adapted to political and social measures that had been implemented from the very start of the democratic restructuring of postsocialist states. Of course, for some social groups transition worked to their advantage, whereas more numerous were those who had difficulties to adapt to the new circumstances, at least for some time. In the cases of states that had been mostly ethnically homogeneous in socialist times (Poland, Hungary, Bulgaria and Romania), the national identifications of their peoples were easily confirmed in the post-Wall times, and links with pre-socialist times were easily re-established, whereas it had to be transformed and re-questioned for the heirs of multinational countries with supranational identity constructions, like the USSR and Yugoslavia (also, to a certain degree, Czechoslovakia), between whom it should be reminded - no easy parallels can be drawn. However, both in the USSR and Yugoslavia the ever increasing weakening of the socialist states during the 1980s, caused basically by huge economic troubles, brought to the surface inter-ethnic conflicts that had previously been kept under control for a long time. The fragmentation of those three complex countries into smaller states with more ethnically homogeneous populations began immediately after the first democratic elections had been organised in 1990. New nations in the newly founded states needed some time to be defined and gain a more certain profile, although seen in retrospect, the foundations for that process had been laid decades earlier, during the existence of those socialist federal states. There is also the particular case of the German Democratic Republic (GDR), for which the fall of the Berlin Wall marked not only the end of socialism but also its reuniting with the rest of the former country that had remained capitalistic after the defeat of Germany in World War II. There is much evidence that the process of reunification of the German nation was not easy on all levels, but its economic power and cultural wealth helped the process significantly.

Although the effects of pro-democracy revolutions in the former "Eastern bloc" have inspired a vast amount of scholarly writings that have analysed those processes and developments, the field of culture has stayed mostly in the shadows, as has been already pointed out. Also, when compared to the space of the visual arts in postsocialist countries, that of music was much less in the focus of researchers, although they both shared a feverish search for a new position in the international art/music market, and a wish to understand the new logic of privatisation and consumerism, but at the same time to save their artistic peculiarities. Bearing in mind such disproportions, we have tended to prepare a volume that would include chapters on art and traditional music, as well as popular music.

After three decades of life in postsocialist countries, a sufficiently long historical distance has been reached that could enable us to take a fairly balanced view on the continuities and discontinuities in all those fields; to consider the sustainability of earlier modes of production and performance, the effects of growing mediatisation, the crisis of state support for music productions and performances, and the transformation of institutions such as unions of composers, conservatories, schools, orchestras, operas, radio, and television. We should also not forget the small corner occupied by us musicologists and ethnomusicologists, whose research has been directly affected by political change. New topics have been introduced, such as the rethinking the music production and institutions of the socialist past, there have been new interpretations and positioning of known events, and the research of archival material that has become available has meant that whole new territories of research have been opened. If only one volume were to be mentioned in that context, it would be the recently published book Russian Music Since 1917 (Zuk and Frolova-Walker 2017), in which valuable contributions have been made to the evaluation of the achievements of post-Soviet musicology (as well as of music production, musical life and other important issues) in Russia. The starting point for the development of postsocialist music was different for each state, and it is of interest to explore the different strategies used in adapting to the transition from socialism to capitalism. It is also relevant to put the question if this specific transition has already been completed in some of those states, while it is still in progress in others; also, in the case of ex-Yugoslav states, to consider the implications of the break-up of the country and the wars that were waged following the fall of socialism. Discussions regarding postsocialist music should also include the so-called 'brain drain', common to all postsocialist states. Although the loss of composers and performers was less drastic than that of medical staff or maintenance and repair workers, for instance, it was, nevertheless, damaging and has had unforeseen consequences for the home countries.

In the present publication, contributions from Slovenia in the west of the former socialist world to Russia and Kazakhstan in the east have been included, meaning that we have overcome the territorial trap and the narrowing of the geographical vision of postsocialist countries to those belonging to Central and Eastern Europe. A voice is given to native scholars, with one exception (a contribution regarding the GDR). According to our knowledge, this type of publication that unites detailed musical studies given from the perspective of different postsocialist contexts, presents a pioneering endeavour in global scholarly frames.

Giving voice to "emic" scholars – we borrow in this context the term used in anthropology and other ethnographic disciplines to reflect different cultural experiences - has allowed us to obtain "insights from within", since most of the contributors of the volume have gained life experience, education, and academic engagement in the socialist and postsocialist societies they write about. The authors were invited to choose subjects according to their own specialist fields (although there were negotiations in some cases, too), which they, as competent and well informed insiders, found relevant for a publication of an international character that was imagined to offer diverse aspects of the effects that the epochal historical break has had on the space of music in their countries. The main idea was to gain a nuanced scholarly insight into specific developments in different countries – former members of the Warsaw pact (again with one exception, Yugoslavia) - and, in that way, to create a wide enough context for observing the selected phenomena. The contributions demonstrate different scholarly approaches, including some in which recent directions in research are combined with those inherited from the socialist times. The very subjects of these works explain the need almost all the authors felt to put objects of their research into political, historical and social contexts.

During the 1980s, in some cases even earlier, art music behind the "Iron Curtain" advanced technically and stylistically to such a degree that it was basically comparable to its counterpart in capitalist countries. Political pressures on composers in socialist countries to adapt to the demands of socialist realism did not last equally and were not similarly strict in all those countries but the overall consequences of isolation from contemporary trends in the West had damaging consequences on their free development. For different reasons, both political in essence, the situation was much more favourable in Poland and Yugoslavia, as is well known. The artistic freedom that came with the beginning of postsocialism was, however, accompanied by a progressive dependence on the market, which brought massive competition, often financial insecurity, and, in most cases, a loss of audiences. Musical institutions were obliged to implement energetic reforms because state subsidies diminished, and the repertoires of performing bodies changed more or less, in search of more attractive programmes and presentations in concerts and the media. There were, however, no general rules be-

cause the conditions in postsocialist countries differed sometimes conspicuously, depending on their pre-socialist traditions and certain local particularities. The selected contributions published in this book testify to the great diversity in that context.

The volume is structured in broadly designed thematic frameworks that are organised within three sections. The first of them, under the title *Rethinking the Past, Shaping the Present: Tradition, Memory and New Music*, is the most heterogeneous in topics and methodological approaches, and refers mainly to the field of art music. The reader is, thus, firstly offered a critical and contextual examination of mutually connected terms/concepts of contemporaneity through the local, pluralised landscapes of Slovenian musical culture. After a detailed analysis of genres in new Lithuanian music, the focus shifts to different narratives on tradition, whether there are re-examinations of Georgian musical past under the Soviet rule or reflections on creative contributions to the "revival" of church/sacred music in postsocialist Ukraine and Serbia. This section of the book closes with a sophisticated consideration of a contemporary German artist's obsession with the Nazi period of the country's history and its effects on the lives of his countrymen on both sides of the Berlin Wall and after its fall.

Leon Stefanija's contribution "Postsocialism and Other -isms in Slovene Music Since 1991: Post/Modernity, Post-Histori/ci/sm (Post-Classicism), Post-Nationalism, and Glocalism" is devoted to defining the characteristic features of the postsocialist/post-Yugoslav music production in Slovenia. Taking as a starting point five mutually related concepts – post/modernity, post/ histori/ci/sm (post-classicism), post-nationalism, glocalism and postsocialism - the author examines the manifestations of the pluralisation of different musical practices in Slovene music of the last three decades. Since exposure to heteronomous musical influences and fusions of styles and genres can be a burden, especially to composers of older generations, there have been attempts to put a little order in that state of affairs. The author cites the academician Lojze Lebič, who pleaded in an essay (2010) for "the establishment of a 'musical-cultural parliament", a "musical tribunal", and a "musical museum" in order to preserve the Slovene musical culture. One of the measures to protect national music culture is the imposed quota for programming of 40% of Slovene music on public radio and television. As a participant in a research project on music and ethnic minorities in Slovenia since 1991, Stefanija has found that nationalism in the Slovene music world is ambivalent, meaning that officially it does not exist in the dominant musical practices, yet is present in certain segments of music production, distribution and reception. He has also noticed interesting intersections between, on one side, national/foreign music, and classical/popular on the other.

In comparison to Stefanija, Gražina Daunoravičienė takes a different scholarly approach to the object of her study in her chapter "Reflections on Lithuanian Postsocialist Music in the Framework of the Genotype Institution". Being mainly interested in the musical analysis of contemporary music, she

meticulously examines a number of representative compositions created in her country in the last thirty years, providing only the most necessary information about the social and cultural context of the times. Having as her principle objective to explore the phenomenon of genre in the postsocialist works of Lithuanian composers, she searches for a new concept of typologies. Continuing her previous investigations (she introduced a concept of *music genotype* as a synonym for music genre), she proposes a system of four typological statuses: the mono-genre of the old tradition, the poly-genre, the free genre ("libro-genre") and the mono-genre of the new tradition. In the sub-chapters of her article, the author inspects the cases of all those categories found in contemporary Lithuanian music, especially their "genetic identity". So she introduces the term *taxon*, referring to the genotype of music, which she treats as an analytical category.

Rusudan Tsurtsumia offers a revised version of the music of the whole socialist period in Georgia, when the country was a republic within the USSR. Her contribution "Rethinking the Soviet-Era Georgian Music" is given from the perspective of a musicologist in Georgia of the postsocialist time who outlines the twentieth-century art music of the country primarily as an integral part of the national culture that had kept the link with the traditional music. The epoch of socialist realism brought the necessity for Georgian composers to contribute to that "identification of ideology with art" that brought a "disastrous state of all musical genres". The author considers the period from the 1930s to the 1950s as the most difficult for music and art (and not just them!) in the history of the Soviet Union, calling it the epoch of "radical socialist realism". However, like in other countries that were victims of such oppressive reality, there were a number of Georgian composers who were able to produce valuable music with individual features. The appearance of the generation of young talented composers in the 1960s is to be seen in the context of a certain liberalisation caused by Khrushchev's ideological thaw. The author also addresses the postsocialist period, which she observes as freighted with political and socio-economic difficulties that affected musical life, so that important musical institutions had to endure years of severe crisis. Despite all the challenges, a new generation of composers has appeared that is displaying a pronounced creative fantasy and experimental spirit.

The next two chapters are devoted to the research of church/sacred music, the field of importance for this volume due to the banning or marginalisation of the genre during the decades of state socialism. The years preceding the collapse of two complex multinational federal states, the USSR and Yugoslavia, witnessed the trends of liberalisation as pre-signs of the decisive events of the 1990s on many levels, including that of the religious one. In the words of Lyubov Kyyanovska, author of the chapter "National and General Signs of the Ukrainian Church Music of the Present", the period of "[t]he late 1980s to the early 1990s marked a decisive turning point, not only in the history of Ukraine, but also in its spiritual life. This was characterised by the completion of the totalitarian stage and the beginning of the next one, by the complex vicissi-

tudes of the revival of the national idea at all levels, and by radical changes in outlook." As in Serbia, composing and performing church music in those years was an expression of the need for the revitalisation of national and cultural identities after the long decades of proscription and temporary alleviations of suppression (Milin 2015; Vesić and Peno 2018; Milanović and Maglov 2019). In Ukraine, that phenomenon has been particularly well-represented since it gained independence. Kyyanovska discusses a large amount of material, providing both data little-known outside the country and classifying them into two main categories: "religious music" and "sacred music", both with several subgroups. The author manages to weave, in a very balanced way, between the complexities of the religious situation in her country.

Very soon after the end of the socialist regime, national identification became a crucial question in Serbia too, all the more so as the inter-ethnic wars began in 1991. Religious peculiarities were used as cultural symbols by all the involved sides of the conflicts, and a general return to tradition and religiosity was seen everywhere (Milin 2011). However, contrary to expectations, as Bogdan Đaković writes in his chapter "Serbian Orthodox Choral Music: Its Revival Over the Last Three Decades", the total number of Serbian composers of Orthodox choral music during the last three decades was, nevertheless, rather small. Đaković is also very critical of their works, maintaining that, with few exceptions, the procedures they used are too eclectic. The focus of that contribution is on the works of four composers especially active in the field of sacred music since the early 1990s. A combined research methodology has been applied by complementing the results of an analytical research with verbal texts from interviews the author had conducted with those composers. The questions raised in those interviews dealt with theological, musical-technical and aesthetical aspects of compositions for the church, including their own, and the responses collected are extremely useful in understanding their vantage points.

The concluding chapter of the first part of the book, "After the End of the World. On Music in Hans Jürgen Syberberg's Café Zilm", displays three particular features that make a difference in the context of this entire publication: (1) its author, Dalibor Davidović, comes from a different country (Croatia) than that which is discussed (Germany), (2) the author's impressions and meditations while visiting the place where the artist's "installation" Café Zilm is being shown are integrated into the scholarly text, and (3) the artist whose work is examined is neither a composer nor a musician, but a film director. The work of that internationally known artist, Hans Jürgen Syberberg (b. 1935), has been strongly marked by an event that happened on the night of 1 May 1945 in Nossendorf, his village in north-east Germany (later in GDR), when thousands of people died as a result of an explosion of ammunition in a forest, which was followed by a lot of violence and suffering. For him, that was "the end of the world" but, at the same time, peace was beginning for the whole world. The trauma left such an imprint on the boy that all his film and literary work produced after he had left GDR for FRG (1953) display his obsessions with the Nazi politics that had led to the war. Besides children's songs, the music of Bach and Mozart, which he learnt at school, became his "artificial homeland", playing an important role in his works. As soon as the Berlin Wall was demolished he visited the village where he was born and the nearby little town where he went to school, deciding to dedicate the rest of his life to "The Nossendorf Project" consisting of film projections, installations and happenings, *Café Zilm* (2017) being a part of them. One of the foci of Davidović's chapter is an examination of the meanings the pieces of music from the great German musical tradition acquire in Syberberg's works.

The second part of the book, entitled *Festivals and Institutions: Strategies of Existence and Survival*, encompasses themes that are highly relevant for the discussion of specific aspects of music in postsocialism, providing necessary problematisations of institutional and/or festival practices in political, financial and social contexts that can be remarkably variable and often insecure in postsocialist countries. Although mutually different in the scope and depth of the research approach, the five chapters written by scholars from Serbia, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Romania, Hungary and Russia are comparable in both similar issues and research findings, offering conclusions that can serve for further, more comparatively based investigations.

The first two contributions of this section of the volume are focused on festivals in the capitals of two neighbouring, ex-Yugoslav states - Serbia and Bosnia and Herzegovina. A very comprehensive and detailed research was undertaken by Jelena Janković-Beguš and Ivana Medić, which resulted in their chapter "On Missed Opportunities: The International Review of Composers in Belgrade and the 'Postsocialist Condition". Through a critical assessment of the entire history of the International Review of Composers, the oldest contemporary art music festival in Belgrade that "came to life and began to develop at the most difficult and turbulent period in the recent history of Serbia" (1992), the authors confirm their starting hypotheses that the Review has neither changed its general "hybrid" programme profile nor "become a national festival of contemporary music [...] in the sense of being recognised as a priority for funding by the Ministry of Culture (and other funding bodies) in Serbia, which would have enabled it to grow in size and reputation, both domestically and internationally". Their analysis takes into consideration the impact of political, economic, social and cultural factors over the festival's almost three-decades existence, the history of which is segmented into three periods: (1) "the war years' (1992–2000)", (2) the "transitional' phase (2001–2006)" that coincides with the onset of the economic transition in the post-Milošević Serbia (Yugoslavia), and (3) the "stagnant' phase (from 2007 to the present)", when the Review witnessed some relatively unsuccessful attempts of change and rejuvenation of its programme conception. There were various "missed opportunities" in all these periods to establish the Review either as a national or as a relevant international festival, which is stressed by the authors, who conclude that the Review has never taken the opportunity "to establish itself as anything but the festival of the profession of academic composers".

As one of the key global trends in the cultural and, more specifically, musical life in the past decades, the festivalisation of events has also spread to postsocialist countries. Fatima Hadžić undertook an investigation of such a very visible trend in Sarajevo. In the chapter "Festival/isation of Art Music - The Collapse or Recreation of Sarajevo Concert Life" the author observes the phenomenon of festivalisation from three perspectives: festivals as (1) an instrument of economic power (creating jobs, a catalyst of city revitalisation); (2) a tool of political power (governing structures instrumentalising festivals, while underfunding the activities of cultural institutions; (3) a means of developing culture and arts (positive effects on the domestic cultural scene). Although the cultural benefit of festivalisation in Sarajevan musical life is quite obvious (for instance, a rise in exclusively art music festivals has been recorded), especially in comparison with only two yearly art music festivals in the socialist period, the author warns that in the distribution of various resources, particularly those of public funds, one should be careful in directing them to a greater extent to fundamental institutions of culture that have continuously serious financial problems, in order that a balance be achieved between the two ways in organising musical/cultural life.

The last three chapters of the section focus on the problems of the work and the functioning of musical institutions. One of them is concerned with the Bucharest Philharmonic, another on the regrouping of power in the main musical institutions in Hungary during the transitional years from the socialist regime to the democratic one, while the third presents a precise investigation into the financial support Russian musical institutions received from different businesses and foundations at the times of the state's retreat from helping all but the most outstanding ones.

The contribution of Valentina Sandu-Dediu presents an examination of an important Romanian national institution whose fate was very much dependent on the changes of official state politics. In her "Socialist and Postsocialist Histories Reflected in the Recent Past of the Bucharest Philharmonic" she analyses the activities of that renowned orchestra (founded in 1868) during the last three decades, which were preceded by more or less prosperous periods and an especially successful one called "the George Georgescu period" (1920-45), remembered mostly for its much upgraded professional skills and intensive contact with the European musical world. With the establishment of the socialist regime, the Philharmonic was transformed into a state orchestra that had no financial difficulties as compensation for its strict control. As in all other socialist countries, the new ideology was reflected in the Philharmonic's repertoires, international tours, selection of guest performers, and comments in concert programmes. The author provides a wealth of relevant facts about those decades, with special attention given to the last years of Nicolae Ceauşescu's presidency, when the economic situation in the country degenerated sharply imposing strict austerity on the orchestra's activities, so that only individual musicians from the Warsaw-pact countries were invited and guest performances of orchestras only from Romania were organised. For concert-goers the postsocialist epoch began in splendour with the guest performances of the

Munich Philharmonic conducted by Sergiu Celibidache in February 1990, as a symbolic gesture of the wish to reintegrate the numerous Romanian musical diaspora in the country's new life. The last part of the article is devoted to the "realities of transition and of the new democracy", specifically the lack of adequate funding, the too small number of premiere performances (mainly in festivals), and the dominance of canonical repertoires neglecting twentieth- and twenty-first-century works and, among them, those of Romanian composers.

Anna Dalos was also interested in the main musical institutions of her country, Hungary, but she focused her investigation to just four years because of their crucial importance for the transmission of political power from the socialist regime to the democratic one. In the chapter "Critical Years: Debates in the Field of Hungarian Music (1988–1992)" she brings to light a number of key problems that institutions such as the Hungarian Composers' Association, the National Philharmonic and the Hungarian Music Society had to face in those years. Open letters sent to opponents, accusations of members of older generations for all the problems inherited from the socialist period, and protest withdrawals from high positions – they all bordered on scandals. A need was felt for the complete re-examination and renewal of the country's music institutional system, the promotion of contemporary music and of composers hitherto neglected for political reasons. Among the events that are closely investigated is the writing of an open letter on 21 March 1992 in which four composers born after 1945 attacked four elder colleagues, former avant-gardists who were still holding senior positions in Hungarian music life, blaming them for privileges, corruption and other benefits. Included into the examination is the Hungaroton affair, in which there is a reflection on the problems of the conflict between the high expectations of promoting national music abroad and the realities of doing business in the international market for a company that used to be successful in the last decade of the socialist regime.

As in the other postsocialist countries, the establishment of capitalism in Russia following the collapse of the Soviet Union brought significant changes in the sphere of financial support to musical institutions, festivals and other events. In the chapter "Music and Business in Postsocialist Russia" Lidia Ader and Konstantin Belousov have investigated sponsorship of programmes performed by the most important opera and ballet houses and philharmonic orchestras in Russia, as well as of many art music festivals across the country. They provide extensive data that confirms that, having diminished its participation in those costs, the state encourages so called indirect support such as private and corporate charity, sponsorship funds, a developed system of tax preferences, an introduction of special (marked) taxes, and the creation of endowment funds. Therefore, numerous musical programmes are being funded by businesses, banks, and industrial enterprises, both domestic and foreign. It is not surprising that the interest in supporting major events, famous performers and festivals that have the status of a brand is usually high, whereas it is often insufficient for operas, orchestras and concerts in cities other than Moscow and St. Petersburg. Sponsorship is less present in philharmonic orchestras than operas and ballets as a result of them

being less "spectacular". The authors have also noticed that more often company support is occasional/unsystematic, rather than regular.

The final section of the volume, *Changing Landscapes of Traditional and Popular Musics*, involves the research of musicologists and ethnomusicologists from Romania, Kazakhstan, Bulgaria and Poland. They deal with complex cultural and musical phenomena that illuminate some local specificities, relating them to global contexts.

Two of the authors analyse traditional music, with a special interest in the postsocialist period, which opens the possibility for comparing similarities and differences in the repositioning and reshaping of traditional music in Romania and Kazakhstan. In her article "Folklore in the Communist Period and its Later Extensions: The Romanian Case", Speranţa Rădulescu offers a synthesising view of the traditional rural and urban music in Romania from the end of World War II to the present day, including research of that music. She takes into consideration the processes of urbanisation, industrialisation, market relations in culture, and the roles of the music industry and the media. Following different genres, the author demonstrates the process of the gradual transformation and decline of traditional music during the socialist period, caused primarily by the depopulation of rural regions, and the growing role of radio and television. However, the same process of peasants (primarily young) leaving villages in search of better-paid jobs happened again after 1990, meaning that rural music lost some of the important base it had had until then, and experienced changes, however, to a greater degree with funeral music than with wedding music, for example. In parallel, the author considers music in cities, from repertoire and its stylistic characteristics, to functional and performative aspects. Recognising the first decade after the collapse of the communist regime as "chaotic" and the next two as "calmer and more constructive", especially after Romania's accession to the European Union, she singles out modernisation, folklorisation and technologies as major challenges for the music that "not long ago we used to call traditional". The author adds to her article valuable comments on some terms that are important for a better understanding of her narrative.

Concerned with the fate of traditional music in her country, Gulzada N. Omarova, in her chapter "Postsocialism and the Culture of Kazakhstan: National Music in the Era of Global Changes", looks with a critical eye at both the seventy-year period of her country's existence as a republic within USSR, and the post-Soviet times of state independence. The Soviet model of musical culture that aimed at imposing Western art music to all the many constitutive nations, including the Kazakhs, who had led a mainly nomadic lifestyle until the early twentieth century, is seen as having been unsuccessful and even damaging because traditional music was subject to "improvements" and transformations imagined to lead to its integration into art music of the European type. During the socialist period, the Kazakhs were increasingly exposed not only to Western art music, quite foreign to them, but also to popular music of various genres, while the preservation of traditional music was not funded

enough. According to Omarova, the rather peaceful and smooth transition to sovereignty caused the national culture to continue to develop in the direction that had been set by the socialist state. The state programmes, in order to work on the better preservation and revaluation of the Kazakh traditional heritage, were launched in 2004 and 2017, so that, among other things, sound anthologies of instrumental and song traditions were released. However, the results have not been convincing enough. Therefore, the author offers some practical steps for enabling the full functioning and development of national musical traditions in the era of globalisation, especially focusing on the problems of the education of traditional musicians, with special attention to skills in traditional music based on improvisation, along with the development of modern types of creativity.

The two last chapters are focused on the strategies applied by domestic musicians of different genres (ethno, rock, metal) to become part of contemporary international trends, incorporating into them elements that would mark them as distinct from the others. Such trends had begun even before the fall of socialist regimes, especially during the 1980s, but the beginning of their life in capitalism brought many more opportunities to connect with the Western world and to be exposed to strong influences of the ever expanding scene of popular music. By way of blending Western pop music styles with local musical traditions, some interesting hybrid styles were generated.

In her chapter "Euphoria and Creativity: Bulgarian Music in the Time of Transition", Claire Levy draws a vivid picture of the complex development in the space of popular music in her country during the last decades of the socialist regime and in postsocialism, mainly focusing on the 1980s and 1990s. As typical features of the local rock music of the 1990s, the author points to lyrics that consistently applied irony and parody and spread socially/politically engaged messages. A similar affinity to informal and uncensored vocabulary was displayed by hip-hop groups in the later years of the century. At the same time, Bulgarian new ethno music, known in the West since the early 1980s, continued to develop, becoming a part of the global phenomenon of world music. According to the author, the new, different cultural climate of potsocialist times "liberalised Bulgarian culture in terms of a more apparent legitimisation of minority ethnic groups". In order to follow the public debates that were held about the nature of cultural heritage in Bulgaria and the contributions to it of minorities like Gipsy or Turkish, it is necessary to be aware of the complicated socio-psychological connotations of the musical traditions of different local ethnic communities that were strongly represented in the new ethno music productions. The question of cultural identity was often discussed in the context of rethinking the nation's orientation either to the "Orient", which has long been linked to backwardness, or to Europe, seen as a "promised land". The author is critical of the exclusion or marginalising of the "local other", while privileging the "distant other" (Western pop-music canon) in national discourses. However, it seems that attitudes towards the "others" are progressively being changed and more inclusive views being adopted.

The subject of the new positioning of the domestic popular music scene in relation to the omnipresent and dominant Western (globalising) one after the fall of socialist regimes is also addressed in Anna G. Piotrowska's article "The Phenomenon of Slavic Metal. The Case of Poland". Announced already in the last decade of the totalitarian state, the Polish version of metal music became radicalised in the early period of transition, gaining more specific traits when some bands decided to include Slavic references in their lyrics. Paradoxically or not, that sub-genre of pagan metal music developed in parallel and most probably under the influence of Scandinavian metal bands that exploited Nordic mythology. As the author observes, "it is necessary to realise the irony of the fact that relying on Slavic pagan mythology connected Polish metal to the Western heavy metal scene". The author investigates the ways in which Polish bands promoted Slavic metal's objective to redefine Polish cultural identity in the post-Wall times. Due attention is paid to the question of the religious implications of celebrating Slavic pagan mythology in a country with a strong Catholic tradition, as well as to the glorification of "Slavicness" that was not rooted in the ideology of Pan-Slavism and Slavic brotherhood. It is suggested that the heroic mythology served as a source of references to the thematisation of the fight for freedom of Slavic nations during the socialist times, so that pagan gods and warriors could be observed as symbols of anti-communist dissidents. Analyses of the influences of extremist ideologies and the transgression and appropriation of Western cultural codes are included in the text.

As we have already mentioned, the texts in this collection could encourage wider comparative musical studies on different variants of more or less similar phenomena in postsocialist countries. On the other hand, diversity, as an important feature of this volume, testifies to the very wide scope of the term "postsocialism" in music, and leads to a further critical examination of its explanatory value. A variety of local contexts goes together with a very wide range of scholar approaches, which we had expected when preparing the volume. Specific features that are displayed in these scholarly contributions can certainly be connected with a number of aspects related to geocultural and historical factors, but also to the different "socialisms" and later socio-political circumstances of "postsocialisms" in those countries, as well as the different local traditions of research and academic positions of individual scholars. Although one part of these contributions indicate integration into contemporary scientific trends dictated by the dominant positions of Anglo-American ethno/musicology, while the other stays almost closed in local research traditions, our attempt to gather various and sometimes almost divergent experiences and viewpoints of emic scholars can be understood as an investment in the decolonialisation of power that determines and controls the production of knowledge about music in global frames.

We believe, as the co-editors of this volume, that the chapters contained in it will contribute in an essential way to an understanding of the processes of transformation according to the ideology of neoliberalism in all spaces of music which have been witnessed in the past three decades and beyond. Until now, much has been written about the music of the socialist period, as a necessary recapitulation and re-evaluation of the then goals, developments and achievements, most often contemplated from the aspects of political dictates and changing social situations. Music in the postsocialist period has gradually become an almost equally important topic both for musicologists and ethnomusicologists on both sides of the former Iron Curtain. Although it leaves many blank spaces, which could not have been avoided in such a pioneering venture, our book, of course, offers a mosaic of analyses of different postsocialist developments that could, we hope, inspire discussions, comparisons and further research.

#### REFERENCES

BOYER, Dominic and Alexei Yurchak (2008) "Postsocialist Studies, Cultures of Parody and American *Stiob*", *Anthropology News* 49: 8.

FALK, Barbara J. (2019) "Legacies of 1989 for Dissent Today", *Eurozine* online, 31 October 2019, https://www.eurozine.com/legacies-of-1989-for-dissent-today/.

GLIGORIĆ, Lidija (2013) *Uzroci neočekivano dugog trajanja procesa tranzicije u Srbi-ji* [The Reasons for the unexpectedly long duration of the process of transition in Serbia], unpublished M.A. thesis, Belgrade: Ekonomski fakultet Univerziteta u Beogradu.

GÖLER, Daniel and Holger Lehmeier (2012) "From Post-Socialist Transition to Globalisation and Europeanisation? Metropolitan Developments in Belgrade, Bucharest and Sofia", *Zbornik radova – Geografski fakultet Univerziteta u Beogradu* 60: 33–48.

HUMPHREY, Caroline (2001) "Does the Category of Postsocialism Still Make Sense?", in Chris Hann (ed.) *Postsocialism: Ideals, Ideologies and Practices in Eurasia*, London: Routledge, 12–15.

JAKOPIN, Edvard (2018) "Privredni rast i institucionalna tranzicija Republike Srbije" [Economic growth and institutional transition of the Republic of Serbia], *Ekonomski horizonti* 20 (2): 95–108.

JELAČA, Dijana and Danijela Lugarić (2018) "Introduction: The 'Radiant Future' of Spatial and Temporal Dis/Orientations", in John Frederick Bailyn, Dijana Jelača, and Danijela Lugarić (eds.) *The Future of (Post) Socialism. Eastern European Perspectives*, Albany: SUNY Press.

LEÓN, Javier F. (2014) "Introduction: Music, Music Making and Neoliberalism", *Culture, Theory and Critique* 55 (2): 129–137.

MILANOVIĆ, Biljana and Marija Maglov (2019) "Mokranjac on Repeat: Reaffirming Musical Canon Through Sound Recordings (PGP-RTB/RTSD iscography)", *Muzikologija | Musicology* 27 (2): 221–252.

MILIN, Melita (2011) "Art Music in Serbia as a Political Tool and/or Refuge During the 1990s", *Muzikološki zbornik* 47 (1): 209–217.

MILIN, Melita (2015) "Orthodox Sacred Music as an Undesirable Segment of Tradition in Communist Yugoslavia", in Stefan Keymund Stephan Wünsche (eds.) Musikgeschichtezwischen Ost und West: von der 'musica sacra' bis zur Kunstreligion. Festschrift für Helmut Loos zum 65. Geburtstag, Leipzige: Leipziger Universitätsverlag, 225–234.

MÜLLER, Martin (2019) "Goodbye, Postsocialism!", Europe-Asia Studies 71 (4): 533–550.

0ST, David (2009) "The Consequences of Postcommunism: Trade Unions in Eastern Europe's Future", *East European Politics & Societies* 23 (1): 13–33.

PICKLES, John (2010) "The Spirit of Post-Socialism: Common Spaces and the Production of Diversity", *European Urban and Regional Studies*, 17 (2): 127–140.

PLATT, Kevin M. F. (2009) "The Post-Soviet is Over: On Reading the Ruins", *Republics of Letters: A Journal for the Study of Knowledge, Politics, and the Arts* 1 (1): 1–26.

ŠUVAKOVIĆ, Miodrag (2017) "Strateške i taktičke tranzicije" [Strategic and tactical transitions], Blog of the Faculty for Media and Communication in Belgrade, 28 November 2017, https://fmk.singidunum.ac.rs/blog/strateske-takticke-tranzicije/.

TODOROVA, Maria and Zsuzsa Gille (eds.) (2010) *Post-Communist Nostalgia*, New York and Oxford: Berghahn.

TODOROVA, Maria (2018) Scaling the Balkans. Essays in Eastern European Entanglements, Leiden and Boston: Brill.

VESIĆ, Ivana and Vesna Peno (2018) "The Structural Transformation of the Sphere of Musical Amateurism in Socialist Yugoslavia: a Case Study of the Beogradski Madrigalisti Choir", *New Sound* 51 (1): 43–63.

ZUK, Patrick and Marina Frolova-Walker (eds.) (2017) Russian Music Since 1917. Reappraisal and Rediscovery, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Народна библиотека Србије, Београд

CIP - Каталогизација у публикацији

78:316.75(4-11)"1990/2020"(082) 32:78(4-11)"1990/2020"(082)

MUSIC in Postsocialism: Three Decades in Retrospect = Музика у постсоцијализму: три деценије касније / editors Biljana Milanović, Melita Milin and Danka Lajić Mihajlović = уреднице Биљана Милановић, Мелита Милин и Данка Лајић Михајловић ; [English translation from Serbian Zorica Simović]. - Belgrade: Institute of Musicology of the SASA = Београд: Музиколошки институт САНУ, 2020 (Mladenovac: GIR MS štampa). - XIII, 349 str.: ilustr.; 24 cm

Tiraž 250. - Notes on Contributors: str. IX-XII. - Napomene i bibliografske reference uz radove. - Bibliografija uz svaki rad. - Registar.

ISBN 978-86-80639-60-4

- 1. Milanović, Biljana, 1967- [urednik] 2. Milin, Melita, 1953- [urednik]
- 3. Lajić Mihajlović, Danka, 1967- [urednik] a) Музика - Социолошки аспект - Источна Европа - 1990-2020
- Зборници b) Политика Култура Источна Европа 1990-2020
- Зборници

COBISS.SR-ID 28288265

